~~SECRET~~

DR/DIA (Tighe)
ARMY ACSI (Thompson)
AF ACSI (Aaron)
LaSerge
Adm. Murphy

MEMORANDUM FOR ~~THE RECORD~~

FROM : Dr. J. Verona, Chairman, GRILLFLAME Working Group

SUBJECT: Comments on "Report By: The GRILLFLAME Scientific Evaluation Committee"

1. The GRILLFLAME Working Group (GFWG) has formulated the following comments of note on the substance and tone of the above report. The GRILLFLAME Scientific Evaluation Committee (SEC) report on PSI investigations contains serious factual errors, an inordinate number of ambiguities, is incomplete and narrowly focused. Because of the aforementioned difficulties, there is a genuine danger the report will provide ~~no, or~~ *little* ~~worse, arbitrary~~ guidance to policy makers and planners responsible for these types of investigations and applications. (S)

2. Although the difficulties in the SEC report have been considered in detail by the GFWG and are available upon request, it was felt the first priority was to provide clear, consistent guidance to those not well acquainted with these areas of investigation. Using the collective experience and knowledge of the GFWG, a ~~consistent~~ restatement of the most important conclusions and recommendations was developed and is ~~herein~~ offered. We first emphasize those aspects of the SEC's report which we strongly support. We support: (S)

CONCLUSIONS

- Unexplained, observations of human capabilities to generate data of potential utility to intelligence have been documented.

- Scientific acceptance of the unexplained data generation capabilities or other claimed "PSI" effects have not occurred because of inadequate investigations, and their possible non-existence.

NOTE: The GFWG adds the possibility that the unexplained capabilities are intrinsically non-scientific, i.e., they could be inherently statistical, ~~non-causal~~, have intrinsic observer effects, etc.

Classified by *D/A(DT)*

Declassify on
Review on *5 Feb 2000*

Extended by *D/A(DT)*
Reason *2.301.C.3*

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Exploratory testing of the intelligence-related utility of these unexplained capabilities is justified and should be expanded beyond current programs.

- Because of our elementary state of knowledge, it is not possible to predict the likelihood of success of investigating the existence, characteristics or utility of these capabilities. However, simple prudence dictates some such investigations are needed, perhaps, in proportion to the apparent utility of the unexplained capabilities. Obviously the order and priority of these investigations is utility determination, then, if possible, existence proofs, and finally characterization studies.

- Efficiency demands a central authority to manage and fund these exploratory investigations for the Intelligence Community and perhaps the entire Government.

- Foreign intelligence analysis on claims of unexplained human capabilities should continue.

The GFWG strongly disagrees with certain viewpoints expressed in the SEC's report. There are:

- The recommendation to terminate the Army's Missile Intelligence Command's PK and Material Systems Analysis Activitie's RV investigations, are based on a misinterpretation of these programs. The recommendation should be dropped unless it...

- Since the most successful current exploitation investigations of these unexplained human capabilities use a data generation technique derived in close conjunction with SRI International researchers, Puthoff and Targ, unqualified condemnation of the recommendation is not understood or acceptable without further explanation.

The GFWG offers to provide more in-depth and detailed comments on the SEC's report. Many of the difficulties in the report, especially those of fact and incompleteness could have been avoided if the report had been collectively reviewed in draft, rather than allowing only individual inputs without review of the final record or analysis. We regret not having had the proper opportunity to contribute to this first attempt at a comprehensive evaluation of an area of high potential importance to intelligence and other Government responsibilities, and wish to assure this situation does not re-occur.

Dr. J. Verona